Texas A&M Law Review ISSN 2837-5165

Published by the Texas A&M University School of Law, 1515 Commerce Street, Fort Worth, Texas 76102.

The Texas A&M Law Review offers annual subscriptions to its publication, which are $55.00 per volume or $22.00 per single issue (postage included). Subscriptions are automatically renewed each year. Subscriptions may be purchased, updated, or canceled by email to the Executive Editor at executive.editor@lawreview.law.tamu.edu.

Copyright © 2024 by the Texas A&M University School of Law. Except as otherwise expressly provided, the Texas A&M Law Review and the author of each article in this issue authorize each article to be reproduced and distributed by nonprofit institutions for educational purposes provided that (1) the copies are distributed at or below cost and (2) the author, the Texas A&M Law Review, and the citation information are identified in each copy. Except as otherwise expressly provided, the author retains the copyright in each article and grants the Texas A&M Law Review a license to publish the article.

All communications should be directed to:
Editor-in-Chief
Texas A&M Law Review
Texas A&M University School of Law
1515 Commerce Street
Fort Worth, Texas 76102
Direct: (817) 212-4000
Fax: (817) 212-4002
eic@lawreview.law.tamu.edu
https://scholarship.law.tamu.edu/lawreview

The Texas A&M Law Review welcomes unsolicited article submissions. Articles should be submitted through Scholastica at https://tamulawreview.scholasticahq.com. Questions regarding article submissions should be directed to the Publications Editor at publications.editor@lawreview.law.tamu.edu.

Cite as: 11 Tex. A&M L. Rev. __ (2024).
Texas A&M Law Review

Volume 11 2023–2024 Number 4

Board of Editors

Managing Editor
Cahill Maffei

Executive Editor
Derek Hudiburg

Editor-in-Chief
Kathryn Keating

Managing Editor
Cahill Maffei

Executive Editor
Derek Hudiburg

Online Managing Editor
Harris Dubin

Symposium Editor
Reid Corbin

Publications Editor
Meagan Corser

Associate Managing Editors
Jordan Thorn
Ny’esha Young

Senior Articles Editors
Don Fidler
Katherine Tyler
Amber Yokubaitis

Equity & Inclusion Editor
Hanita Flora

Citations Editors
Madison Abatti
Emma Dooher
Lauren Hollaway

Articles Editors
Genene Adams
Rachel Baine
Sierra Ross

Notes & Comments Editors
Mallory M. Heffington
Sean Keller
Mark Roundtree

Associate Executive Editor
Victoria Miller

Senior Staff

Alexa Auger
Michael P. Bitgood
Blake Bobo
Tanner Daniels
Zachary Fechter
Justin Higdon

Hunter Jones
McKenna Martinez
Kelsey McKechnie
Caitlin Rodgers
Andrew Sorensen
Kelsi Sorrells

Jacob Spicer
Tim Stafford
Anna VanPelt
Kaid Walters
Conner Watson
Sarah Williams

Staff

Gabrielle Armstrong
Janelle Briggs
Cahlen Cheatham
Kyle Chrisman
John Colson
Caleb Cook
Christian De La Cruz
Haley Dewey
Haley Fair
Christopher Flanagan

Taylor Grover
Arthur Harris
Kasey Haught
Ann Johnson
Michael Johnson
Elizabeth Kruse
Meek K. Lee
Matthew McGrenera
Melanie McIntire
Ainsley McNally

Robert Notari
Tiana Pham
Payton Ramsey
Brandon Robinson
Rafael Saplala
Tyler Scattolini
Ian Stephens
Carolyn Wheeler
Ben Whisman
Kirsten Worden

Faculty Advisors
Wayne Barnes & Peter Yu

Staff Advisor
Kelly Basinger-Parr
CONTENTS

REMARKS

KEYNOTE: NCAA v. Alston and the Future ................... Jeffrey Kessler, Robert Ahdieh & Meg Penrose 769

ARTICLES

False Start on NIL: Public and Private Law Should Treat College Athletes Like Any Other Student ................................................. Jodi S. Balsam 785

College Athlete Unionization .................................... Roberto L. Corrada 829

New Amateurism .................................................... Michael A. McCann 869

Off the Guardrails: Opportunities and Caveats for Name Image Likeness and the [Student] Athlete Influencer. .......................... Maureen A. Weston 911

The NIL Paradox: How Unfettered NIL Rights Will Shrink Student-Athlete Opportunities ....................... Gary D. Way 949

ESSAYS

An Antitrust Analysis of the NCAA Transfer Policy ................... Michael A. Carrier & Marc Edelman 999

Good Lawyers, Good Sports?: The Professional Identity of Sports Lawyers Representing Not-for-Profit Entities .................. Bruce A. Green 1019
ARTICLE CONTRIBUTORS

Jeffrey Kessler  
*NCAA v. Alston and the Future*

Jeffrey Kessler is a partner and Co-Executive Chairman of Winston & Strawn, LLP and the co-chair of its antitrust and competition practice. He was formerly co-chair of Winston & Strawn’s Sports Law Practice. He is one of the world’s leading antitrust, sports law, and trial attorneys and has argued landmark cases at levels as high as the United States Supreme Court, including *NCAA v. Alston*, *McNeil v. NFL*, and *Brady v. NFL*. Kessler received both his Bachelor’s Degree and J.D. from Columbia University where he was on the board of editors of the *Columbia Law Review*. He is also a Lecturer-in-Law at his alma mater, Columbia Law School, and was the co-editor-in-chief of the ABA Antitrust Law Section’s *State Antitrust Practice and Statutes*.  

Robert Ahdieh  
*NCAA v. Alston and the Future*

Robert Ahdieh is the Dean & Anthony G. Buzbee Endowed Dean’s Chair of the Texas A&M University School of Law, Vice President for Professional Schools & Programs of Texas A&M University, and Chief Operating Officer of Texas A&M–Fort Worth. He received his Bachelor’s Degree from Princeton University and his J.D. from the Yale University School of Law where he was a Senior Editor on the *Yale Journal of International Law*. Ahdieh clerked for the Honorable Judge James R. Browning of the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit. Before coming to Texas A&M, Ahdieh was a K.H. Gyr Professor of Private International Law and Vice Dean at the Emory University School of Law. He is a member of the American Law Institute and an American Bar Foundation Fellow.  

Meg Penrose  
*NCAA v. Alston and the Future*

Meg Penrose is a Professor of Law at the Texas A&M University School of Law. She attended law school at the Pepperdine School of Law where she graduated *magna cum laude* and she received an LL.M. in International Human Rights from the University of Notre Dame where she graduated *summa cum laude*. Penrose clerked for the Honorable Judge Jerry Buchmeyer of the United States District Court for the Northern District of Texas during the 1993-’94 term and worked as a staff attorney to the Honorable Magistrate Judge—now U.S. District Judge—Jane J. Boyle, also of the United States District Court for the Northern District of Texas. Before teaching at Texas A&M, she was a Professor of Law at the Texas Wesleyan School of Law and the University of Oklahoma College of Law.
Jodi S. Balsam
False Start on NIL: Public and Private Law Should Treat College Athletes Like Any Other Student

Jodi S. Balsam is a Professor of Clinical Law and Director of Externship Programs at Brooklyn Law School. She is also an Adjunct Professor of Law at the New York University School of Law. Balsam received her Bachelor’s Degree from Yale University and her J.D. from the New York University School of Law. After law school, Balsam clerked for the Honorable Chief Judge Charles L. Brieant on the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York and the Honorable Chief Judge Dennis Jacobs on the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit. She is an independent arbitrator on the NCAA’s Independent Resolution Panel and was formerly counsel for operations and litigation at the National Football League. She contributes, edits, and provides on-air commentary to the NBC/Universal Sports Group, Law360.com, LawInSports, and the Journal of Legal Aspects of Sport.

Michael A. Carrier
An Antitrust Analysis of the NCAA Transfer Policy

Michael A. Carrier is a Board of Governors Professor of Law at the Rutgers University Law School and a leading authority in antitrust and intellectual property. Carrier received his Bachelor’s Degree, summa cum laude, from Yale University and his J.D., cum laude, from the University of Michigan School of Law where he was the Book Review Editor of the Michigan Law Review. He clerked for the Honorable Judge John D. Butzner, Jr., on the United States Court of Appeals for the Fourth Circuit. He advised the 2020 Biden-Harris presidential campaign on policy issues, served on the ABA Antitrust 2016 Presidential Transition Task Force, and co-authored a leading intellectual property and antitrust treatise: IP and Antitrust: An Analysis of Antitrust Principles Applied to Intellectual Property Law.

Marc Edelman
An Antitrust Analysis of the NCAA Transfer Policy

Marc Edelman is a Professor of Law at the Zicklin School of Business, Baruch College, City University of New York and an Adjunct Professor of Law at the Fordham University School of Law. Edelman graduated magna cum laude from the University of Pennsylvania Wharton School of Business, holds Master’s Degrees from the University of Michigan and Baruch College, and received his J.D., cum laude, from the University of Michigan School of Law. In 2023 he was a Fulbright Scholar at the University of Canberra and he is the Director of Sports Ethics at the Robert Zicklin Center for Corporate Integrity. He co-authored Esports and the Law: A Game Plan for Legal and Business Trends and Careers in Sports Law.
Roberto L. Corrada

College Athlete Unionization

Roberto L. Corrada is a Professor of Law and Mulligan Burleson Chair in Modern Learning at the University of Denver Sturm College of Law. He received his Bachelor’s Degree from the George Washington University and his J.D. from Catholic University of America Law School where he was Editor-in-Chief of the Catholic University Law Review. Corrada is a member of the American Law Institute and the Co-Founder and Co-Chair of the Advisory Board of the Denver Urban Debate League. He has testified in front of the United States Senate Committee on Labor and Human Resources, the Colorado Senate Judiciary Committee, and the United States NAFTA Panel. In 2018 he was elected as a fellow to the College of Labor and Employment Lawyers.

Bruce A. Green

Good Lawyers, Good Sports?: The Professional Identity of Sports Lawyers Representing Not-for-Profit Entities

Bruce Green is the Louis Stein Chair of Law at the Fordham University School of Law and the Director of the Louis Stein Center for Law and Ethics. Green was awarded his Bachelor’s degree, summa cum laude, from Princeton University and his J.D. from the Columbia University School of Law where he was a James Kent and Harlan Fiske Scholar and an Associate Editor of the Columbia Law Review. After graduating, he served as a law clerk for the Honorable Judge James L. Oakes on the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit and to the Honorable Justice Thurgood Marshall on the United States Supreme Court. Before coming to Fordham, Green was an Assistant United States Attorney and the Chief Appellate Attorney at the Office of the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of New York. He is a member of the Board of Trustees of the Federal Bar Council and Chair of the MPRE Drafting Committee of the National Conference of Bar Examiners.

Michael A. McCann

New Amateurism

Michael A. McCann is a Professor of Law and Founding Director of the Sports and Entertainment Law Institute at the University of New Hampshire Franklin Pierce School of Law. In Fall 2023, McCann was a Visiting Professor of Law at the Harvard Law School. At the Franklin Pierce School of Law he created the first ever law school course on name, image, and likeness. McCann earned his Bachelor’s Degree, magna cum laude, from Georgetown University, his LL.M. from Harvard Law School, and his J.D. from the University of Virginia School of Law where he was Editor-in-Chief of the Virginia Sports and Entertainment Law Journal. McCann is a leading scholar on sports law, co-author of The Oxford Handbook of American Sports Law, and an award-winning journalist on the staff of Sportico.
Gary D. Way  
*The NIL Paradox: How Unfettered NIL Rights Will Shrink Student-Athlete Opportunities*

Gary D. Way is a member of the board of directors of Townsquare Media, Inc., and the board of trustees of the New York University School of Law Foundation. Way is the former head of the Sports Marketing Center of Excellence within the NIKE, Inc. legal department. He served in various roles at the company over his 24-year tenure and retired as General Counsel of NIKE’s Jordan brand division. He is on the Dean’s Advisory Council at the Rutgers University School of Arts and Sciences and the Board of Advisors of the National Sports Law Institute at the Marquette University Law School. Way was awarded his Bachelor’s Degree from Rutgers College and his J.D. from the New York University School of Law.

Maureen A. Weston  
*Off the Guardrails: Name Image Likeness and the Student Athlete Influencer: Opportunities and Impacts/Caveats*

Maureen A. Weston is a Professor of Law and the Director of the Entertainment, Media, and Sports Dispute Resolution Project at the Pepperdine University Caruso School of Law. Before Pepperdine, Weston was an Associate Professor at the University of Oklahoma College of Law and a visiting professor at the University of Colorado School of Law. Weston received her Bachelor’s Degree from the University of Denver, where she graduated *magna cum laude*, and her J.D. from the University of Colorado School of Law. From 2009 to 2012 she was Pepperdine’s Associate Dean for Research.